The story of Skeptical Science How citizen science helped to turn a website into a go-to resource for climate science

Bärbel Winkler – Skeptical Science

Dr. John Cook – George Mason University





EGU General Assembly 2020

Online | 4–8 May 2020

Skeptical Science

ABOUT * ABSTRACTS & PROGRAMME * SHARING GEOSCIENCE ONLINE * REGISTRATION FEES * MEDIA * GUIDELINES * 42 *

[Back] [Session ITS1.8/SSS1.1]

EGU2020-562 https://doi.org/10.5194/egusphere-egu2020-562 EGU General Assembly 2020 © Author(s) 2020. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



The story of Skeptical Science: How citizen science helped to turn a website into a go-to resource for climate science

Bärbel Winkler¹ and John Cook^{1,2}

¹Skeptical Science, Fellbach, Germany (baerbelw@skepticalscience.com)

²Center for Climate Change Communication, George Mason University, Fairfax, Virginia, United States of America (jcook20@gmu.edu)

Skeptical Science (SkS) is a website with international reach founded by John Cook in 2007. The main purpose of SkS is to debunk misconceptions and misinformation about human-caused climate change and features a database that currently has more than 200 rebuttals based on peer-reviewed literature. Over the years, SkS has evolved from a one-person operation to a team project with science-minded volunteers from around the globe. The Skeptical Science team also actively contribute to published research, with a highlight being the often cited 97% consensus paper published in 2013 (Cook et al. 2013) for which team members content-analysed about 12,000 abstracts in a study whose publication fee was crowd-funded by readers of the website.

The SkS author community formed in 2010 in response to the proposal to expand existing rebuttals to three levels: basic, intermediate, and advanced. Since then, team members regularly collaborate to write and review rebuttal and blog articles for the website. Volunteer translators from many countries have translated selected content into more than 20 languages including booklets such as The Debunking Handbook, The Uncertainty Handbook or The Consensus Handbook. In addition to the already mentioned consensus study, team members have helped with other research projects initiated by John Cook such as the efforts to train a computer to detect and classify climate change misinformation. Another significant project is the Massive Open Online Course (or MOOC) "Denial101x: Making Sense of Climate Science Denial" in collaboration with the University of Queensland, for which the SkS team produced numerous video lectures and for which forum moderators were recruited. Outreach activities such as the "97 Hours of Consensus" were crowdsourced with team members collecting and organising content and providing technical support.

Challenges: Due to the volunteer nature of people's involvement, there are some challenges involved as not everybody is available to help with tasks all the time. People help as much – or as little – as their time allows and there's always some turn-over with new people joining while others leave.

Skeptical Science (SkS): (accessed November 29, 2019)

Cook, J., Nuccitelli, D., Green, S. A., Richardson, M., Winkler, B., Painting, R., Way, R., Jacobs, P., & Skuce, A. (2013). . Environmental Research Letters, 8(2), 024024+.

Cook, J., Schuennemann, K., Nuccitelli, D., Jacobs, P., Cowtan, K., Green, S., Way, R., Richardson, M., Cawley, G., Mandia, S., Skuce, A., & Bedford, D. (April 2015). Denial101x: Making Sense of Climate Science Denial. *edX*.

Cook, J., & Lewandowsky, S. (2011). . St. Lucia, Australia: University of Queensland. ISBN 978-0-646-56812-6.

INTRODUCTION TO SKEPTICAL SCIENCE

Skeptical Science (SkS) is a website and non-profit science education organization with international reach founded by John Cook in 2007. The main purpose of SkS is to debunk misconceptions and misinformation about human-caused climate change and features a database that currently has more than 200 rebuttals based on peer-reviewed literature. SkS has evolved from a one-person operation to a team project with volunteers from around the globe. The Skeptical Science team also actively contribute to published research, with one of the highlights being the often cited 97% consensus paper published in 2013.

A technical note:

The text and many of the graphics included in this presentation contain embedded links to internet content. In the text these links are underlined and graphics with a link show this little icon:





THE MANY FACETS OF SKEPTICAL SCIENCE



TOOLS

RESOURCES

Climate Graphics: Denial101x Braphics from lectures in the Massive Open Online Course, Making Sense of Climat DENIAL101x 1.2.1 Climate Drivers vs Climate Pat





C.A.R.D.S. Computer Assisted Recognition of **Denial** and Skepticism







LIST OF LINKS

SKEPTICAL SCIENCE FOUNDER JOHN COOK

John Cook originally earned a Bachelor of Science at the University of Queensland, achieving a First Class Honors with a major in physics. He obtained a PhD in cognitive psychology at the University of Western Australia, with the thesis "<u>Closing the "consensus</u> gap" by communicating the scientific consensus on climate change and countering misinformation". Currently, he is a research assistant professor at the <u>Center for Climate Change Communication</u> at George Mason University, with a research focus on developing communication and educational strategies to counter misinformation.

The roots of Skeptical Science can be traced back to early 2007, when Cook decided to create a private database as a resource to more easily counter the arguments from family members regarding anthropogenic global warming (AGW). He described the backstory in a <u>Guardian article⁵ in 2011</u>: "My exploration of climate change denial began innocuously enough – namely some vigorous discussions with sceptical family members. This provoked me to dig a little deeper into the science (no one wants to lose an argument with their fatherin-law), but before I knew it, I had wandered into a bewildering labyrinth of raging online debates and bottomless pits of misinformation. How to make sense of it all?

At this point, my inner-computer geek asserted itself and I began constructing a database of climate 'sceptic' arguments. To cut to the truth of each argument, I made peer-reviewed science the ultimate authority. There's no higher standard than evidence-based research conducted by experts, which is then rigorously scrutinised by other experts. As I began to piece together the various pieces, a clear picture began to emerge."



SKEPTICAL SCIENCE TEAM

Many people from around the globe make valuable contributions to Skeptical Science. They write blog posts, maintain rebuttals, create graphics, or author useful software tools. Furthermore, they contribute by moderating the comments sections, editing and proofreading posts, sharing information with visitors, responding to emails, and providing technical support. There are also many regular commenters whose feedback has helped to improve and hone the website's content. Volunteers from all over the world have translated selected content into more than 20 different languages. All of this work is done in the volunteer contributors' spare time and everybody helps as much as time allows and where their interests take them. Click on the picture to head to the Welcome Page on Skeptical Science!

Skeptical Science



A global team of volunteers



HISTORY OF SKEPTICAL SCIENCE - Part 1

BACK









Skeptical Science (SkS) goes live with John Cook publishing his rebuttal database in July 2007.

Skeptical Science becomes

Twitter. Translations are now

More than 580 blog posts

get written by 85 authors

and SkS wins the Eureka

Prize from the Australian

Members of the SkS team

consensus among papers

caused global warming.

publish a study finding a 97%

stating a position on human-

active on Facebook and

possible.

museum.







Twenty-something blog posts get published in what John Cook called a pretty boring year.

The introduction of three levels of complexity for the rebuttals is pivotal as the author team is born.

SkS continues to increase its reach with research summaries, detailing the history of climate science and many other offerings.

Clicking on the buttons will take you to related material on the Skeptical Science website!



HISTORY OF SKEPTICAL SCIENCE - Part 2







The SkS-team keeps publishing research papers and runs the "97hours of consensus" campaign.



Team members contribute to the IPCC 1.5°C report and more myth-debunking resources are published.







Collaborating with the University of Queensland the MOOC Denial101x gets launched.

Skeptical Science celebrates its 10th Birthday and we can now track daily rebuttal views to better gauge interest in them.

Our consensus paper published in 2013 hits one million downloads in July – not bad for a citizens' science project!

Clicking on the buttons will take you to related material on the Skeptical Science website!



REBUTTALS

The backbone of Skeptical Science is a database with more than 200 articles rebutting misinformation about human-caused global warming. Many of the explanations exist in a basic, an intermediate, and an advanced version and all reference peer-reviewed primary research. The rebuttals tackle common misconceptions about global warming such as "It's not happening", "It's not us", "It's not bad", and "It's too hard". Some of the rebuttals are regularly viewed more than 50,000 times per month. On the homepage, the climate myths are listed by popularity (e.g. how often each argument appears in online articles) or with fixed numbers for permanent references. They are also available sorted into taxonomic categories for systematic access.



MOST USED Climate Myths

and what the science really says.

- Climate's changed before
 It's the sun
 It's not bad
 There is no consensus
 It's cooling
 Models are unreliable
 Models are unreliable
 Temp record is unreliable
 Animals and plants can a
 It hasn't warmed since 19
 Antarctica is gaining ice
 View All Arguments...
- Global Warming & Climate Change Myths Here is a summary of global warming and <u>climate change</u> myths, sorted by recent popularity to what science save. Click the response for a more detailed response to a Here is a summary of global warming and <u>climate change</u> myths, sorted by recent popularity vs what science says. Click the response for a more detailed response. You can also view them sorted by taxonomy, by popularity in a print friendly varion, with short popularity vs what science says. Lick the response for a more detailed response, fou c also view them sorted by taxonomy, by popularity, in a print-friendly version, with short What the Science Says "Climate's changed before" Climate reacts to whatever forces it to change at the time; humans are now the dominant forcing. 2 "It's the sun" In the last 35 years of global warming, sun and climate have been going in opposite directions "It's not bad" Negative impacts of global warming on health & environment far ou "There is no consensus" Climate Myths sorted by taxonomy It's not happening Temp record is unreliable Tree-rings diverge from temperature after 1960 Hockey stick is broken Ljungqvist broke the hockey stick Dropped stations introduce warming bias It's Urban Heat Island effect 1934 - hottest year on record Satellite error inflated Great Lakes temperatures Satellite record is more reliable than thermometers We're heading into an ice age o It's cooling 2009-2010 winter saw record cold spells It's freaking cold! Record snowfall disproves global warming Record high snow cover was set in winter 2008/2009 Oceans are cooling It hasn't warmed since 1998 Global warming stopped in 1998, 1995, 2002, 2007, 2010, ???? BEST hides the decline in global temperature No warming in 16 years DMI show cooling Arctic We're heading into cooling

BLOG POSTS

Blog Posts written by team-members, or reposts from other outlets, are published on a regular basis to highlight recent research or other relevant topics relating to human-caused climate change. There are some recurring series where, for example, climate science gets explained via analogies. Recently published research articles have been listed on a weekly basis as have the articles posted to the Skeptical Science Facebook page. Readers can subscribe to receive a daily email listing the recent





BACk

Skeptical Science New Research for Week #13, 2020

Posted on 1 April 2020 by doug bostrom



Physical science of global warming & effects Global response of evapotranspiration ratio to climate conditions and watershed characteristics in a changing environment

Greenhouse effect: the relative contributions of emission height and total absorption

Observations & observational methods of global warming & effects

46 Articles

Climate change induced a new intermittent regime of convective ventilation that threatens the Black Sea oxygenation status (open access)

Regional differences in global glacier retreat from 1980 to 2015

Long tern trends (1958-2017) in snow cover duration and depth in the Pyrenees

Modeling & simulation of global warming & global warming effects

How could a difference of 0.5°C in global warming modify the mean and extreme climate conditions around Antarctica?

Climate change projections for the Australian monsoon from CMIP6 models



- YouTube's Climate Denial Problem
- Skeptical Science New Research for Week #13, 2020
- A history of FLICC: the 5 techniques of science denial
- Scientists share their grief, anger, and hope over climate change
- 2020 SkS Weekly Climate Change & Global Warming Digest #13
- 2020 SkS Weekly Climate Change & Global Warming News Roundup #13
- Aggressive action to address climate change could save the world \$145 trillion
- Skeptical Science New Research for Week #12, 2020
- Emissions: Coronavirus & Climate Change
- The pros and cons of planting trees to address global warming
- 2020 SkS Weekly Climate Change & Global Warming Digest #12
- 2020 SkS Weekly Climate Change & Global Warming News Roundup #12
- Is becoming vegan the best thing people can do to reduce Greenhouse Gas emissions?
- Skeptical Science New Research for Week #11, 2020
- UK's CO2 emissions have fallen 29% over the past decade
- Fallacy Taxonomy and Icons available via Wikimedia

THE SCIENTIFIC CONSENSUS

On May 16, 2013 the study "Quantifying the consensus on anthropogenic global warming in the scientific literature" led by John Cook was published in Environmental Research Letters (ERL). The paper found that among (over 12,000) peer-reviewed abstracts on the subject 'global climate change' and 'global warming' published between 1991 and 2011, over 97% of the papers taking a position on the subject agreed with the consensus position that humans are causing global warming.

Publishing the consensus study caused a stir, from being tweeted by President Obama's Twitter account, to mention in media outlets around the globe. Vigorous attacks were swift in coming as well. To preempt anticipated criticisms, a homepage for the project was set up and has been kept current with adding links to relevant material and FAQs as needed. In April 2014, Environmental Research Letters announced that the <u>Skeptical Science</u> <u>consensus paper was voted ERL's best article of 2013</u> - a considerable outcome for a citizen science project.



TRANSLATIONS

Since translation capabilities were added to SkS at the end of 2009, selected content has been <u>translated</u> into more than 20 languages by teams of volunteers working together across the globe. The individuals and teams tackling translations decide what to translate. Rebuttals are the area offering the most translations.

Translation teams have access to shared online folders in which they can prepare and proofread translations for selected content, making this a highly collaborative activity. When people voice an interest in helping with translations they can either work with others they already know or they can join an existing team for their language. The blog post Your chance to make a difference published in January 2014 outlines the many translation related activities people can contribute to: blog posts, rebuttals, and handbooks are just three of several options available.



DENIAL101x – Making sense of climate science denial

Since April 2015, SkS has offered the massive open online course (MOOC) "Denial101x: Making sense of climate science denial". This online course is a collaboration between the Skeptical Science team and the UQx team at the University of Queensland. The 60 lectures and 40 expert interviews explain the basics of climate science while addressing common climate myths from "global warming stopped in 1998", to "global warming is caused by the sun", to "climate impacts are nothing to worry about". By learning the techniques of science denial, students acquire the critical thinking needed to identify the fallacies associated with a given myth. Finally, armed with all this knowledge, participants learn about the psychology of misinformation. This is intended to equip them to effectively respond to climate misinformation. As of 2019, the MOOC has had more than 40,000 participants from over 180 countries. Members from the SkS-team provide assistance in and moderate the MOOC's online discussion forum.



DISCUSSION MODERATORS



Meet our Global Moderator Team

All of our discussion forums for this course will be moderated by a team of volunteers from around the globe to ensure that we can provide contact for students from all timezones. Each moderator's role is to monitor the forums in order to respond to inquiries or problems, ask clarifying questions and generate quality discussion among participants. Our moderators also make sure that the discussion forum guidelines are followed by all participants.

Here is a list of the moderators who have graciously given their time to create learning opportunities and facilitate participant interaction within our course. We are very thankful for all of the help and guidance they provide.



C.A.R.D.S.

Computer

Assisted

BACK

Denial and

Automated detection of online misinformation is the "holy grail" of fact-checking, considered potentially offering theoretical insights and practical responses. Drawing from a corpus of over 287,000 documents from blogs and conservative think-tank websites, the Skeptical Science team worked with political scientists Travis Coan and Constantine Boussalis to develop a comprehensive taxonomy of climate misinformation. Supervised machine learning techniques to accurately detect specific skeptical claims about climate change was employed to construct a detailed history of misinformation over 17 years. Climate misinformation was found to focus predominantly on attacking the integrity of climate science and scientists, a notable result given the dearth of research into attacks on scientists. As well as offering a new approach to understanding and detecting climate science skepticism, this research lays the groundwork for developing applications that inoculate social networks against misinformation.

C.A.R.D.S. Project Example paragraph C.A.R.D.S. According to a number of sources, the climate is no longer warming, in fact, some claim the planet has been cooling since 1998. If we fit a ✓ Select a super-claim linear trend line to the annual 1. Global warming is not happening global land-ocean surface air r. Subuser warring is not independently 2. Human greenhouse gases are not causing climate change 2. Jumants investor are knowed in the formation of the second s imperature for the period 1998 to 3. Climate impacts are beneficial/not bad 2008, there is no real trend. The 4. Climate solutions won't work satellite-based, balloon-based, and 5. Climate movement/science is unreliab not rea hermometer-based global temperature records show no uncertain warming whatsoever over the past hiatus (193) models not bad climate change SUI no consensus not ds 31,000 **Recognition** of Skepticism



RESOURCES

Skeptical Science features a large section of graphics and animations, licensed under creative commons to make them readily available for reuse. The graphics and animations are created by talented team members to support blog posts, rebuttals, and other materials and have been reused in books, textbooks, TV documentaries and government reports.





TOOLS

Members of the Skeptical Science team have created various tools which help to put climate science into perspective like the <u>Temperature Tool</u> created for the MOOC Denial101x or the <u>Heat Widget</u> which can be added to other websites.

Since 2013, the <u>SkS-Glossary</u> has been available. This tool triggers pop-ups with explanations for scientific terms used in blog posts and rebuttals. The underlying definitions originated from the IPCC glossary published with its Fourth Assessment Report (AR4) in 2004. The glossary also stores and offers references for scientific papers.





[close all]
Glacier ×
A mass of land ice that flows downhill under

gravity (through internal deformation and/or silding at the base) and is constrained by internal stress and friction at the base and sides. A glacier is maintained by accumulation of snow at high altitudes, balanced by melting at low altitudes or discharge into the sea. See *Equilibrium line; Mass balance*.

Definition courtesy of IPCC AR4,

Land surface air temperature × The surface air temperature as measured in well-ventilated screens over land at 1.5 m above the ground. Definition courtey of IPCC AR4.



Consensus on consensus: a synthesis of x consensus estimates on human-caused global warming

Cook, J., Oreskes, N., Doran, P. T., Anderegg, W. R., Verheggen, B., Maibach, E. W., ... & Nuccitelli, D. (2016). Consensus on consensus: a synthesis of consensus estimates on human-caused global warming. Environmental Research Letters, 11(4), 048002. <u>Link to paper</u>

DOI: <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1088</u> /1748-9326/11/4/048002

CHALLENGES

Being a volunteer-based organization, Skeptical Science faces issues and challenges other such organizations do, like lack of time due to other commitments or trouble to find helping hands for specific time-consuming but rather mundane tasks like fixing broken links or keeping the published material as current as possible.

Being a popular go-to resource regarding human-caused climate change and tackling the misinformation about it has made Skeptical Science the target of various forms of attacks. There are ad hominem attacks on the team and individual members and various conspiracy theories about the website's funding can be found online. To wit: there's no funding apart from some PayPal donations!

One particular event needs to be mentioned: In 2012 the Skeptical Science website was hacked and content from the private author forum was posted online. To this day, it is quote-mined by interested parties to make the team look bad.





RECOGNITION

In September 2011, the SkS team won the Eureka prize from the Australian museum, for the advancement of climate change knowledge. The Eureka Prize, presented annually seemented since 1990, has been described as Australia's "Oscars of Science". The prize recognizes and rewards excellence in the fields of scientific research & innovation, science leadership, school science, and science journalism & communication.

The National Center for Science Education (NCSE)—a large non-profit organization supporting teachers in the U.S. who want to teach evolution and climate science without interference from religious or political groups—named Skeptical Science as one of 2016's recipients of their Friend of the Planet Awards.

Many scientists regularly refer others to Skeptical Science as the go-to-resource for questions about climate science and to look for debunkings to regularly heard misinformation. A collection of endorsements is available on the homepage.





"Skeptical Science is a fantastic resource for debunking misinformation about climate change. The articles and materials are all grounded in the scientific literature, and presented in an approachable and understandable way. It is a particularly helpful resource for helping students and other young people separate the facts from the myths."





Professor, Department of Geography, University of British Columbia



"I used John Cook's SkepticalScience.com as the student resource for this semester's research papers. As you will see from the four example papers highlighted on this blog, information found at SkepticalScience.com is accessible to the typical college student and likely to the general public."

Skeptical Science

Scott Mandia



Professor of Global Climate Change, Suffolk Community College





Bärbel Winkler Skeptical Science BaerbelW[at]skepticalscience[dot]com Fellbach, Germany



Bärbel Winkler lives and works in Germany. She has always had a lot of interest in environmental issues and has been active as a volunteer at the local zoo and a conservation group for many years. Over time and while learning more and more about it, Bärbel became increasingly aware and concerned about climate change and what it will mean for generations to come. As a means to turn her concerns regarding climate change into something productive, Bärbel joined the Skeptical Science team in 2010 and started translating selected content into German. Since 2013 she has been coordinating the translation efforts for all languages, contributes a blog-post every once in a while, helps with many projects and became co-author of several consensus-related studies the Skeptical Science team has published over the years. She also coordinates the moderation team for the online course "Denial101x – Making sense of climate science denial".

https://sks.to/BaerbelW



John Cook George Mason University jcook20[at]gmu[dot]edu Fairfax Virginia U.S.A

John Cook is a research assistant professor at the Center for Climate Change Communication at George Mason University, researching cognitive science. In 2007, he founded Skeptical Science, a website which won the 2011 Australian Museum Eureka Prize for the Advancement of Climate Change Knowledge and 2016 Friend of the Planet Award from the National Center for Science Education. John co-authored the college textbooks *Climate Change: Examining the Facts* with Weber State University professor Daniel Bedford. He was also a coauthor of the textbook *Climate Change Science: A Modern Synthesis* and the book *Climate Change Denial: Heads in the Sand*. In 2013, he published a paper analyzing the scientific consensus on climate change that has been highlighted by President Obama and UK Prime Minister David Cameron. In 2015, he developed a Massive Open Online Course at the University of Queensland on climate science denial, that has received over 40,000 enrollments.

https://communication.gmu.edu/people/jcook20



LIST OF LINKS

CONSENSUS continued

Skeptical Science – https://skepticalscience.com Best ERL-paper 2013 – https://skepticalscience.com/SkS-consensus-paper-ERL-best-article-2013.html 97hours - https://skepticalscience.com/nsh/? Dissertation – https://skepticalscience.com/docs/Cook_dissertation.pdf Cook et al. 2016 – https://sks.to/coc One Million downloads – https://sks.to/tcp-one-million 4C – <u>https://www.climatechangecommunication.org/</u> Guardian – https://www.theguardian.com/environment/blog/2011/apr/28/climate-change-denial-TRANSLATIONS All translations – https://skepticalscience.com/translation.php Helping with translations – https://sks.to/help-translate Debunking Handbook – https://sks.to/debunk Welcome page - https://sks.to/welcome DENIAL101X 2007 – https://skepticalscience.com/A-look-back-SkS-in-2007.html MOOC on edX – https://sks.to/Denial101x 2008 – https://skepticalscience.com/A-look-back-SkS-in-2008.html UQx Team – https://itali.uq.edu.au/about/projects/uqx 2009 – https://skepticalscience.com/A-look-back-SkS-in-2009.html Wakelet Collection – https://wakelet.com/@denial101x 2010 - https://skepticalscience.com/A-look-back-SkS-in-2010.html MOOC moderation - https://skepticalscience.com/docs/Cook 2017 MOOC.pdf 2011 – https://skepticalscience.com/A-look-back-SkS-in-2011.html C.A.R.D.S. - Computer Assisted Recognition of Denial and Skepticism 2012 - https://skepticalscience.com/A-look-back-SkS-in-2012.html 4D project - https://www.climatechangecommunication.org/the-4d-project-countering-misinformation/ 2013 – https://skepticalscience.com/A-look-back-SkS-in-2013.html RESOURCES Graphics – https://skepticalscience.com/graphics.php Interactive timeline – https://skepticalscience.com/cshistory.php 2014 - https://skepticalscience.com/A-look-back-SkS-in-2014.html 2015 - https://sks.to/sks2015 The Escalator – https://skepticalscience.com/graphics.php?g=47 2016 - https://sks.to/sks2016 TOOLS 2017 - https://sks.to/sks2017 Temperature Tool – https://skepticalscience.com/temperature_tool.html 2018 - https://sks.to/sks2018 Glossary – https://skepticalscience.com/glossary.php 2019 - https://sks.to/sks2019 Heat Widget – <u>https:</u>//sks.to/heat CHALLENGES Arguments - https://skepticalscience.com/argument.php Conspiracy theories - https://skepticalscience.com/Conspiracy-theories-Skeptical-Science.html Fixed numbers – https://skepticalscience.com/fixednum.php Hack – https://sks.to/hack Taxonomy – https://skepticalscience.com/argument.php?f=taxonomy RECOGNITION Eureka prize – https://skepticalscience.com/Eureka Prize Winner 2011.html Skeptical Science – https://skepticalscience.com/newsarchives.php NCSE – https://ncse.com/ Friends of the Planet – https://ncse.com/news/2016/05/friend-darwin-friend-planet-awards-2016-0017058 Cook et al. 2013 - https://iopscience.iop.org/article/10.1088/1748-9326/8/2/024024 Endorsements – https://skepticalscience.com/endorsements.shtml Consensus Hompage – <u>https://skepticalscience.com/tcp.php?t=home</u> Skeptical Science

BACK



INTRODUCTION

skeptical-science

JOHN COOK

TEAM

HISTORY 1

HISTORY 2

REBUTTALS

BLOG POSTS

CONSENSUS